

## **Social Space Occupation by Street Vendors In Makassar City**

Arfenti Amir<sup>1</sup>Darmawan Salman<sup>2</sup> Imam Mujahidin Fahmid<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Student of Doctoral Program in Sociology at State University of Makassar

<sup>2</sup>Lecturer at Hasanuddin University

<sup>3</sup>Lecturer at Hasanuddin University

Corresponding Author: Arfenti Amir

---

**Abstract:** This study aims to obtain in-depth information about the occupation of social space by street vendors in the city of Makassar. This research is a qualitative research by using phenomenological approach. The data was collected by using in-depth interviews, from printed and electronic media; the researchers acted as the research instruments. The data was collected from the informants including street vendors, community leaders, NGOs and related parties. The data was obtained from two sources, namely documentation and informants. The data collection was done through in-depth interviews. The data was then analyzed to find out the Occupation of Social Space by street vendors in Makassar city. The results of this research showed that the Occupation of Social Space by street vendors in the city of Makassar was due to the lack of intensity of areas prepared for street vendors and the lack of the government's attention in providing space to street vendors.

**Keywords:** Occupation, Social Space, Street Vendors

---

Date of Submission: 30-06-2018

Date of acceptance: 17-07-2018

---

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

Makassar city is one of the big cities in eastern Indonesia and it becomes the center of industry, service and trade. Referring to statistical data, before the 1997 financial crisis, the formal sector absorbed 31.7 million workers and the informal sector absorbed 53.7 million workers. After the financial crisis in 2002, the formal sector absorbed only 29.1 million workers, while the informal sector absorbed 62.4 million workers (BPS-Statistics Indonesia, 2002).

The lack of available jobs further enlarges the competition between individuals in society. The enactment of free trade, in which individuals are free to compete with others, makes the society inevitably have to face a condition of competition that sometimes leads to high social inequality. The absorption of labor from the modern industrial sector that had originally been a hope for job seekers is now getting lower. The increasing number of workers does not match the availability of employment, thus demanding them to be self-employed, for instance, as a street vendor, which is one of the alternative business in the informal sector that arises from the lack of available job opportunities faced by big cities, including Makassar. The increase of migration of population from villages to the city every year has an impact on the lack of employment available in Makassar city. As a result, the number of unemployed people increases since they do not have the skills required for the available jobs so that they decide to look for jobs that do not require certain skills, one of which is to be a street vendor.

This condition often causes problems for a city. One of the most frequent problems from urban dualism is the problem of informal activities in the trade sector, i.e. the activities of street vendors (PKL). These street vendors usually occupy public spaces (sidewalks, parks, riverside areas, and drainage channels) that result in such public spaces not being able to be utilized by their users properly (Soetomo, 1996).

City activities disturbed by the increasing number of unorganized street vendors cause the declining quality of urban environment. The existence of street vendors who occupy public spaces also results in changes in the function of these spaces. For example, the reduction of green open spaces, the occupation of sidewalks by street vendors who disrupt pedestrians, and the occupation of roadsides by street vendors that cause traffic congestion.

Street vendors are always looking for a strategic location to sell even if they have to get out of the market and choose the roadside as a strategic place for them to sell. The social problem faced by street vendors in terms of traditional markets and development, at least in most cases, is the eviction of markets. The urban phenomenon illustrates the many cases of development, which are less sympathetic to lower class society,

especially street vendors who have small capital. The dissatisfaction of street vendors over the treatment experienced is triggered by the reason that the government wants to do control in which there is sometimes greater economic motive behind it. In this case, the government is more in favor of large capital owners by giving permission to build malls and modern markets, so that small capital owners such as street vendors are getting pushed out and even displaced.

## **II. RESEARCH METHOD**

This research is a qualitative research with phenomenological approach. Process and meaning (subject perspective) are more highlighted in qualitative research on street vendors in Makassar City. Theoretical basis is used as a reference so that the focus of the research is in accordance with the facts in the field. The theory used related to the social construction of the street vendors' space is Henri Lefebvre's theory, and the theory used in relation to the street vendor's resistance as a symbol is James Scott's theory. In addition, the theoretical foundation is also useful to provide an overview of the research background.

This study was conducted in Makassar City of South Sulawesi Province, with consideration of the condition of the area indicating the existence of various problems related to the presence of street vendors. The points or road segments that were used as the locations of the research included in the market category were the Central Market and Pabbaeng-beng Market, while the non-market category were along the Hertasning Street and along the Alauddin Street. In addition, the researchers also conducted the research on several related institutions.

The data source is where the data is obtained. The researchers used questionnaires or interviews on data collection. Then, the sources of data were the respondents including street vendors or the actors themselves, Government or related parties, academics, and NGOs.

Qualitative data analysis was done through Data Reduction (selecting the main points relevant to the research), Data Display (allowing the presentation of data through matrix and graphs according to the research needs), Data Verification and Conclusion (looking for the main similarities among the results of the interview) and Collecting the final analysis of the data. Data analysis gained credibility, conformity and confirmability of all informants.

## **III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

### **1. Henri Lefebvre's Theory of Social Space**

Occupation and roads are also representations of the social space that is developed from the practice of exchange between street vendors and urban community customers that are not properly accommodated. Thus, with reference to "Lefebvre's" theory of the Production of Space, this phenomenon can be explained as an input for reference in the process of space conception, which will lead to the form of a geometric environment that gives the perception of appropriate space use to represent the social relationship it carries.

City space is not a three-dimensional cavity of geometry that can be simply translated in the form of maps. The dynamics of the city must be seen through what Lefebvre (1991) calls social space, which is space as a social product with various activities of people in it. Based on Lefebvre's explanation, city space is a public space if it produces social space when people do activities in it.

Social space is used as a facility, and its function has turned into a work space and reproduction for street vendors as described by Mujiarjo (2012) "Occupational Against Urban Public Space" that the change of the function of public space into a private work space for street vendors results in the deprivation of rights of others to the public space. Although the presence of street vendors positively impacts the rotation of the urban economy, it also has a negative side as an urban spatial problem. The existence of street vendors who occupy urban public spaces such as sidewalks and roads is caused by the city Government that does not provide space for street vendors when formal sector activities are emerging. Thus, occupation of public space by street vendors exists from the regulation of the City Government and is a structural marginalization. The theory used is the theory of structuration that the apparatus as an agent has succeeded in taking action based on the knowledge of the agent himself to achieve his desire. The agent of the ruler (government) with its agency creates rules that arise from agreements with street vendors in terms of occupation of sidewalks and roads. This study only reveals government policy as the structure or agent of the ruler. One of the factors causing street vendors to occupy social space is the government regulation in making the rules and the implementation of the policy of the City Government in controlling street vendors in the city of Makassar that is not running well in accordance with the purpose and intent of the implementation of the policy. The existing policy has not been able to parse the issues since it is less relevant to the complexity of the problems related to street vendors. A policy, that can provide comprehensive solutions to the problem of street vendors, is needed, especially a solution to the existence of street vendors in Makassar (Nur, YuliGani, Soeidy 2014).

Government regulation that has not been able to overcome the problem of space availability for street vendors causes them to occupy and resist, as explained by EkoSiswono in his dissertation "Resistance and Accommodations: A Study on the Relationship of Power to Street Vendors (PKL), Preman (Thugs) and

Officials in Depok” that describes the resistance of street vendors due to the Regional Regulation (Perda). He emphasized how power relationships existed between the three components in undertaking a strategy to strengthen control of the sidewalks. Giddens’s theory used to explain social practices among them marked the working of power due to the relationship between structure and agency. Resistance occurs because the regulation, according to street vendors, is not in line with the reality they have to face.

Mc. Gee, and Y.M. Yeung in their research “Hawkers in Southeast Asian Cities” (1977, p. 108) state that street vendors agglomerate on wide pedestrian paths and places frequently visited by large numbers of people close to markets and the public, and commercial terminal terminals, in which trading patterns of street vendors adjust the rhythm and characters of the society in daily life. The timing of street vendors’ activities is also based on formal activities. McGee and Yeung (1977) see that street vendors will always be engaged by targeting a location where human concentration occurs such as shopping centers, private or government offices.

Street vendors are always looking for a strategic location to sell even if they have to get out of the market and choose the roadside as a strategic place for them to sell. The social problem faced by street vendors in terms of traditional markets and development, at least in most cases, is the eviction of markets. The urban phenomenon illustrates the many cases of development, which are less sympathetic to lower class society, especially street vendors who have small capital. The dissatisfaction of street vendors over the treatment experienced is triggered by the reason that the government wants to do control in which there is sometimes greater economic motive behind it. In this case, the government is more in favor of large capital owners by giving permission to build malls and modern markets, so that small capital owners such as street vendors are getting pushed out and even displaced.

## **2. James Scott’s Theory of Resistance as a Symbol**

Occupation of social space by street vendors is a symbol of resistance and aspects of meaning, and the description of actors and social actions. Regulation of Makassar City Government which regulates street vendors (PKL) through Regional Regulation No. 10 of 1990 on the training of street vendors and various Decrees/Regulations of Makassar Mayor (Perwali) on organizing and controlling street vendors in fact have not been able to be a solution for urban problems and road traffic such as order, the beauty of the city, and for the existence of street vendors itself. The policy on street vendors’ regulation is often reaping resistance from street vendors because the existing policy does not provide a solution to the existence of street vendors.

The resistance can vary from open to closed resistance which is not so visible. As with many cases of market evictions, each case may be different. The form of market traders' resistance that is often visible and open is the clashes between traders and municipal police (Satpol PP), which sometimes result in casualties, between traders, and between traders and developers in the case of market evictions for the construction of hotels and modern shopping centers. This is a social anxiety where the market that should be the center of the economy of the lower class society must be maintained and not displaced for the sake of the order of the economy of a city or a game of larger capital owners. In the face of the various pressures imposed by the government which are perceived to be very limiting to their space, street vendors have some techniques or strategies they deliberately develop to deal with these pressures. They manifest them in the form of resistance.

Market as a form of traditional economic system and as an informal sector cannot survive in the midst of the development that is increasingly strangling the informal sector. Market is not only a place for distribution of goods and services, but is also an environment for people living side by side, which evolves and then becomes a habitus and a cultural trait that then shapes the life of society. Not a few traditional markets are missing from the relationship of social life and changed into big buildings, hotels, and modern markets. The absence of market will result in reduced revenue for traders. The implication is that they are fighting against eviction of their selling places and will occupy public spaces as their location to sell. The existence of street vendors in Makassar becomes a phenomenon when they are faced with various problems that press them related to their existence. Even, most of the places they use to sell are snatched away by economic actors with large capital.

The number of street vendors in the central market is about 871 (Source: interview with the head of the market). The market once experienced a fire and has now been repaired or renovated and will be prepared for traders. Some traders who have been relocated have remained selling around the central market. Some have left and moved to another place, and some others even use cars to sell as an alternative choice. The life of street vendors faces various problems as experienced by one trader selling clothes in the central market. Before the fire, the trader had a place to sell, and after the fire, the government gave them a new place to be used temporarily, although very small and limited. Some of them have rented the place with a relatively expensive price. They will return to occupy the central market after being renovated but they have to rent the place for a price greater than the previous price. This makes some traders choose to leave the place or move to another place because they cannot afford to pay the rent. Street vendors in the central market are diverse; some are selling hijabs, Muslim clothes, curtains, jewelry/accessories, and many others.

The same thing happens to the Pabbaeng-baeng market. It is clearly seen that the market has undergone a renovation/repair, which is of course with the aim that the existing traders along the road can occupy the market that has been built and destined for them. However, ironically, there are still some traders who keep selling outside the market area or along the Pabbaeng-baeng Street. An interview with one of the traders shows that some of them cannot afford to pay or rent the place/space provided because the price is very expensive and not affordable by lower-class economic traders. In addition, there is also a comparison between selling in the market area and selling on the sidewalk. They consider that the profits they get from selling outside the market area are much larger than selling in the market area. Thus, they choose to keep selling on the sidewalk by using it as the place to sell. Most traders who sell along the Pabbaeng-baeng market sell basic needs such as rice, vegetables, fruits, and some even sell clothing, sandals, and other household supplies. Selling activities that they do often get warning from the local government because they can disrupt road access, cause congestion, and make the place look slum. The number of street vendors is approximately 14 thousand spread across 14 sub-districts in Makassar city (Makassar in number, 2013).

The above case can also be found along the Sultan Alauddin Street, precisely in front of UIN Center and along the road to Unismuh Campus. There are many street vendors selling along the street and some even use the sidewalks as the location or place to sell. Goods they sell are diverse; some sell dolls, glasses, watches, clothes, hijab, pulses, food, toys, and some even sell LPG gas. They choose to sell along the sidewalks because the access is considered easier, the rent is also affordable or inexpensive, but they also sometimes feel in an unsafe position due to their illegal status and frequent warning from the local government as they sell on the road edges that can cause congestion and disrupt the flow of traffic.

The Hertasning Street experiences similar case. Most spaces of the street are filled with street vendors. Many of them are selling by using a tent, stall, and, the most current trend, by using a car. According to one trader who uses a car, selling on the side of the road is easier, practical, attracts the consumer, gives bigger profit, and is tax free as they just pay parking fee to occupy the space. Another benefit is when there is control or raid by municipal police officers (Satpol PP) that they can just move directly or leave the place, and when the officers are gone, they return again selling on the roadsides. It clearly indicates that selling on roadsides disrupt access and highway users, and often cause congestion, damage the beauty of the city, and even cause an accident. Almost all staple goods are sold along the Hertasning Street such as chicken porridge, yellow rice, fruits, drinks, clothing, shoes, cakes, jackets, household supplies, and many more. The number of traders initially was about 200, which is growing every day and continues to develop as they consider that selling on the roadsides provides easier access, bigger profit, and easier sales.

Despite the ease the street vendors get from selling on the roadsides, their presence has social impacts and problems such as (1) disruption of highway access, congestion and inconvenience for road users, (2) giving the impression of slum and destructing the beauty of the city (2) causing accidents for riders and drivers, and even pedestrians, and (3) causing clutter and dirtiness.

The results of this study indicate that what street vendors do is one form of their disappointment and dissatisfaction with the existing regulations and the lack of land prepared for them so they choose to occupy social space as the place to sell. They have to do so because of economic demands and to make ends meet so that they resist if their selling place is evicted. One form of resistance that has been done when they experience raids and evictions by government officials is to immediately leave the place and disappear for a while. However, after the officials have left, they rebuild their stall and return to sell at the same place without heeding the warnings given, even though they have to be worried about the government officials that can come unnoticed. They do such things because of their economic needs.

The rise of street vendors using social space is caused by the lack of productive lands which is economically advantageous for them, and of other places that are not enough to accommodate the increasing number of street vendors every year. The difficulties caused by the limited productive lands for street vendors make them tend to occupy roads, which are considered more productive, providing greater benefits, attracting consumers, and more accessible as a place to earn a living. The Government Regulation related to the legalization of street vendors is very detailed but not implemented in spatial policy, so that street vendors occupy urban social space.

So far the informal sector, especially the street vendors, in urban areas still causes many problems because, based on the conditions in the field, they are always marginalized from the flow of city life, and do not have a clear legal status as they always become the object of evictions in urban areas. To continue to exist, they must survive in a plural urban environment with diverse activities. Street vendors are very visible as a part of a city and are usually spread over strategic areas especially in the city center, and they are present naturally alongside the development that occurs in the formal sector. This is a phenomenon of lower class society economic activity. The presence of street vendors raises many issues related to order, crowd, and cleanliness. The act of controlling by municipal police is one of the causes of the clashes between the street vendors and the municipal police (Satpol PP).

The rise of street vendors leads to the emergence of various problems. There is an assumption that the presence of chaotic and disorganized street vendors disturbs the order, beauty and cleanliness of the environment. Careless selling locations even tend to occupy sidewalks and greatly disrupt the traffic for bikers or drivers, and even pedestrians. In addition, the buyers who park their vehicles unorganized also severely disrupt the order. So far, street vendors have not been aware of the importance of cleanliness so that the beauty of the environment is difficult to be realized. The quality of traded goods must also be taken into account, so that the consumers will not be disappointed.

The congestion problem is not a sectoral issue anymore, but rather a part of the various city problems that are interconnected with each other. Many factors cause the occurrence of congestion. Some of the factors causing congestion include the capacity of roads that can not accommodate the number of passing vehicles. Some roads are actually unable to accommodate vehicle activities at certain hours.

In addition to the reduced capacity of roads, some traffic lights that are not accurate anymore (less functioning) are also the cause of increasing congestion. Another factor that contributes to the occurrence of congestion is the presence of street vendors. It is inevitable that the activities of street vendors, especially those around the streets of the city center that occupy the roads, contribute to congestion. Congestion occurs because roads are filled by street vendors, pedestrians, pedicabs, and motorcycles. The congestion is caused by the number of private vehicles passing in the center of the city simultaneously.

The process of change that takes place makes the city as a place to live, for economic activities (service, trade, industry), as well as a government center (administration). For that reason, urban planning is necessary as a natural manifestation of an urban settlement that continues to thrive. This development leads to an ever-increasing number of people accompanied by issues of employment, settlement provision, transportation, infrastructure, public facilities, urban economy, and environmental conservation.

The main objective of the implementation of sustainable spatial planning is to realize the welfare of the society so that in the process of sustainable development the participation of the community with their local wisdom should be given clear tools and mechanisms to interact in the implementation of spatial planning. This is because every step in a development requires a mature plan to be profitable in all aspects and to be sustainable. Every city planning is aimed at the welfare of the society, comforting the society to live and engage in the city, and making the city sustainable. Sustainable city is a city that can be occupied and of which resources can be utilized by the society. This is part of the responsibilities of the actors and the government.

From time to time, the development of the city is so fast, but is not accompanied by the right spatial patterns. As a result, problems such as environmental degradation, congestion, social crises, riots, and crimes that are ubiquitous, especially in big cities, metropolises and megapolis so that the term "hyper-city" is also called macrocephaly or city with enlarged head and with the population of more than 15 million, which is very unhealthy. The phenomenon of sick city, sick people, and sick world, arise because the city has become a source of tension and stress, and as a source of disease in national development.

People living in a city are heavily burdened and suffer from existential anxieties, employment worries, and information overload. The economic gap that is so striking, social jealousy, sense of helplessness and pressure, and tolerance limit lead to dissatisfaction. Destruction, arson and looting are forms of resistance from the marginalized people in the process of urban development. There are also allegations that these are caused by a dirty political game. If such a tendency persists, the death of human beings in the city will soon become the death of the city. On the other hand, the city's development can not be inhibited because the city is "the single most complex product of the human mind." The city is like a living body that always grows and develops in accordance with its potential and problems, or in line with the handling of its obstacles.

Preventing humans from rushing into a city is a futile act. They have a strong instinct and a burning determination to improve their standard of living. Therefore, the important thing is how to manage the city with a more just and democratic spatial planning. The fact shows that more than 80% of the city plans have not been implemented as expected. The wide gap between ideals, expectations, theories and spatial plans of the city with reality, practice and its implementation is a major problem in urban spatial planning. The underlying cause of the problems revealed above is the lack of active participation of the community in the process of city development.

Street vendors occupy social space due to structural stresses and their helplessness over existing regulations. On the one hand, they do the occupation for survival and economic opportunity. On the other hand, as noticed along the Hertasing Street, they do the occupation because they take advantage of economic opportunities to make a profit. They come with their own patterns and self-awareness based on their knowledge and experience to sell along the street in order to survive, and some street vendors are present because of limited land and space to sell, thus taking over the function of social space.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

There are an increasing number of street vendors in Makassar City, especially street vendors who do not have a fixed place to sell, so they occupy road or sidewalks to sell. This is due to the lack of availability of space or places provided by the government, and because of government indifference to those who do not have large capital, so they prefer the roadside as a place to sell. On the one hand, they sell on the sidewalks using social space as a form of protest and resistance to the absence of the Country in granting them access in order to survive. Indeed, they must get a space to sell, but in fact there are still many of them who do not get a decent place to sell. Street vendors mostly make sales along the street by using sidewalks that often cause congestion and disrupt traffic flows, even causing conflicts between them. This study provides the pattern of social space occupation by street vendors in Makassar City. This research is expected to serve as a reference to the development of social science and for policy makers, society in general, and traders in Makassar City.

#### REFERENCES

- [1]. Agustang, Andi. (2011) *Filosofi Research Dalam Upaya Pengembangan Ilmu*. Makassar
- [2]. Anonim. (2007) *Kota Makassar Dari Wikipedia Indonesia, ensiklopediabeasberbahasa Indonesia*. Available from: <http://www.makassarkota.go.id> [Accessed 30/03/2015].
- [3]. Aswad, Al. (2015) *The Informal Sector of Shaping City Commercial Open Space*. In The 5<sup>th</sup> International Conference of the International Forum of Urbanism (IFoU). Singapore: Global Visions: Risks and Opportunities for the Urban Planet.
- [4]. Aswar, Nasrun. (2008) *Dampak Krisis Ekonomi Terhadap Keberadaan Pedagang Kaki Lima*. Available from: <http://id.shvoong.com/social-sciences/1776191> [Accessed 30/03/2015].
- [5]. BPS Kota Makassar. (2010) *Makassar dalam angka*. Makassar: UD. Aresso.
- [6]. Beilharz, Pater. (2005) *Teori-Teori Sosial Observasi Kritis Terhadap Para Filosof Terkemuka*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- [7]. Giddens, Anthony. (1997) *Central Problem in Social Theory*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- [8]. Geertz, Clifford. (1989) *Penjajadan Raja: Perubahan Sosial dan Modernisasi Ekonomi di Dua Kota Indonesia*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- [9]. Henri. (2003) *The Urban Revolution*. Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press.
- [10]. Indrawijaya, A. Ibrahim. (2010) *Teori Perilaku dan Budaya Organisasi*. Bandung: Rafika Aditama.
- [11]. Keith Hart. (1973) Informal Income Opportunities and Urban Employment in Ghana. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 2 (1), pp. 61-89
- [12]. Lefebvre, Henri. (2000) *The Production of Space*. New York: Georgetown University Press.
- [13]. Manning, Chris. and Effendi, Tadjuddin Noer. (1996) *Urbanisasi, Pengangguran dan Sektor Informal di Kota*. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia.
- [14]. Mc. Gee, T.G. and Yeung, Y.M. (1977) *Hawkers In South East Asian Cities: Planning for The Bazaar Economy*. Ottawa: International Development Research Centre.
- [15]. Nur, Yuli. and Gani, Soeidy. (2014) Implementasi kebijakan pemerintah kota dalam penertiban pedagang kaki lima. *Jurnal Birokrat Ilmu Administrasi Publik*, 2.
- [16]. Ritzer, George. (2003) *The Postmodern Social Theory*. Translated by Muhammad Taufik. Yogyakarta: Kreasi Wacana
- [17]. Syamsu Alam. (2012) Analisis Kebijakan Publik, Kebijakan Sosial di Perkotaan Sebagai Sebuah Kajian Implementatif. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 1.
- [18]. Widjajanti Retno. (2009) Karakteristik Aktifitas Pedagang Kaki Lima Pada Kawasan Komersial di Pusat Kota. *Jurnal Teknik*, 30.

Arfenti Amir .” Social Space Occupation by Street Vendors In Makassar City.” *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science (IOSR-JHSS)*. vol. 23 no. 07, 2018, pp. 16-21.